



Historic Preservation Commission

Regular Meeting

<http://www.townofboone.net/>

~ Agenda ~

Jane Shook
828-268-6960

Tuesday, December 10, 2019

3:00 PM Planning and Inspections Conference Room

I. Call to Order

II. Adoption of Agenda

III. Approval of Minutes

October 15, 2019 Meeting Minutes

November 12, 2019 Meeting Minutes

IV. Historic Design Guidelines

V. Other Matters by Board Members or Staff

VI. Adjournment

**TOWN OF BOONE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
OCTOBER 15, 2019
3:00 PM**

Historic Preservation Commission Members in Attendance: Chairperson Eric Plaag, Vice-Chairperson Phoebe Pollitt, Bettie Bond, Teresa Pearman, Loretta Clawson and Rennie Brantz

Town Staff in Attendance: Christy Turner-Senior Planner and Marlene Crosby-Board Secretary

Others Present: Roberta Jackson and Diane Blanks, Members of the Junaluska Heritage Association

Call to Order

Chairperson Eric Plaag called the meeting of the Boone Historic Preservation Commission, held in the Planning & Inspections upstairs conference room located at 680 West King Street, to order at 3:02 p.m.

Adoption of Agenda

Member Brantz made a motion, seconded by Member Clawson to adopt the agenda as amended by moving the Survey Presentation to Council to before the Downtown Survey Boundary and adding an overview of the Hayes Bryan Cemetery by Ms. Mary Moretz as the first agenda topic.

Vote:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Approval of Minutes

Member Clawson made a motion, seconded by Member Brantz to approve the September 10, 2019 meeting minutes as amended.

Vote:

Aye – (Bond, Brantz, Clawson, Plaag)

Nay – None

Abstention – (Pollitt)

The motion passed.

Hayes Bryan Cemetery

Communication: October 15, 2019 Meeting Minutes (Approval of Minutes)

Chairperson Plaag explained that Ms. Mary Moretz had requested to give a brief overview of the Hayes Bryan cemetery (permanently on file). Ms. Moretz noted that this cemetery located between two residences on Charles Street is not owned by the Town of Boone. She said she is presenting this information on the cemetery at the October 2019 Council meeting to make the Council members aware some of the founders of Boone are buried there. She also talked about Town of Boone partnering with the heirs of the families for the upkeep of the cemetery. She noted that Mr. Bryan was a former Mayor of Boone and Mr. Hayes had a connection to Daniel Boone.

Chairperson Plaag asked Ms. Christy Turner, Senior Planner who owned the land that the cemetery is on. Ms. Turner said that she would research the current landowner of the cemetery.

Chairperson Plaag thanked Ms. Moretz for sharing the information on the cemetery and asked her to let the Council know that she has already shared this information with the HPC members. He also explained that the HPC members would need direction from Council to be able to review and discuss said cemetery in future meetings.

Ms. Moretz left the meeting at approximately 3:23 p.m.

Survey Presentation to Council

Chairperson Plaag said at last month's Council meeting he presented the Survey report. He said at that Council meeting there was some discussion on the parallel processes of the actual survey versus a district designation. He said he was given two sets of direction by Council at this meeting.

The first thing that Council directed Chairperson Plaag to prepare was the final draft version of the Survey report to submit to Ms. Annie McDonald, Preservation Specialist at the State Historic Preservation Office. He said Ms. McDonald is not obligated to respond within 30 days to the HPC. He noted that it might be next month before he is able to submit the final draft report to SHPO. He noted that both the Western and State offices are behind on reviewing reports. He said it might be the first of next year before the HPC members hear back from the SHPO.

The second thing that Council directed Chairperson Plaag to create a Downtown Boundary Map. Chairperson Plaag explained that he worked with the Town of Boone GIS staff person on what areas to add to the map.

Downtown Survey Boundary Map

Chairperson Plaag explained that he will be presenting the HPC members recommendations on the Downtown Survey Boundary map (permanently on file) to Council.

Discussion ensued on the western boundary of the Downtown Survey Boundary map. Chairperson Plaag said that the HPC member's discussions on the western boundary have always been vague. He said that he has always thought the Watauga County Administration

Building and the County building behind it where the old Watauga County Library was located should be included. He said he also thought there was merit in extending the boundary to the 1963-1964 Stanley Harris Apartment Complex on Queen Street because Mr. Harris is one of the founders of the Boy Scouts. In addition, he said that the complex falls into the period of significance listed in the survey report. He suggested that the Linney House be included in the historic district because of the geography and it already has historic status.

Member Pearman joined the meeting at approximately 3:30 p.m.

Motion and Vote:

Vice-Chairperson Pollitt made a motion, seconded by Member Bond to accept the proposed Downtown Survey Boundary Map as directed by Chairperson Plaag and prepared by the Town GIS staff person, Chris Miller and for Chairperson Plaag to present the proposed map to Council.

Vote:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Chairperson Plaag told the HPC members that he would give them a report on what the Council says about the proposed map and Council may give the HPC members some general direction on how to proceed on the historic district process.

Junaluska Marker Application

Chairperson Plaag welcomed Junaluska Heritage Members Roberta Jackson and Diane Blanks to the HPC meeting. JHA Member Blanks explained that she was asked by JHA Member Sue Keefe to fill in for her at this meeting because Ms. Sue Keefe is out of town.

Discussion ensued on the September 21, 2019 Junaluska Marker Application revised draft. Chairperson Plaag reviewed his comments and Ms. Sue Keefe's comments in the 14-page draft application (permanently on file).

Discussion ensued on who worked on the Junaluska Marker Application. Ms. Blanks asked Chairperson Plaag who the HPC members worked with in the Junaluska Community on the draft application. Chairperson Plaag explained that the HPC members responded to a draft application that was submitted to the HPC members by JHA Member Sue Keefe. He said the HPC started the review process with her draft application. He also explained in the review process of the draft application, the HPC members found some of the information appeared to be based on a second-hand or tertiary source; but there was no primary source evidence for some of the claims. He talked about the adding of footnotes to address the lack of evidence for some of the claims.

Discussion ensued on the title of the Junaluska Marker. Chairperson Plaag talked about previous discussions by the HPC members, regarding whether Junaluska is a neighborhood or a

community. He suggested using the term community rather than neighborhood which implies just geography. Members Blanks and Jackson agreed with using The Junaluska Community in the title.

Discussion ensued on Polly Grimes. Chairperson Plaag talked about retaining the point listed in the draft by dropping the reference to Polly Grimes and put the information into a footnote that says as one example Polly Grimes is listed as a domestic in the Anderson household, however, her sister was Jonathan Anderson's wife because it is not clear if she was domestic in this household or a domestic into some other household in Boone.

Discussion ensued on Troy Councill. Chairperson Plaag suggested adding a footnote to address the marital status.

Discussion ensued on the Boone Chapel. Chairperson Plaag said he is open to rewording this section and he is concerned how Ms. Keefe has suggested to change it. She suggested changing the wording to the following: "but fell into decline following the lynching of two church members in 1932 and the exodus of more than 32 church members to Philadelphia and it was condemned and demolished in 1996". Chairperson Plaag recommended at this point inserting: "it stood for nearly 100 years and finally succumbed to demolition in 1996".

Discussion ensued on lynching. Chairperson Plaag read how in 1932 the Watauga Democrat described the deaths of two Junaluska residents one being Ralph Horton. He said that what is curious is that Norwood Horton was not mentioned in the listing that has been made by the national project. He said that he believed that someone could make the argument that this was not a lynching because the posse killed Ralph Horton rather than an early mob. He said that he does not care to make this argument.

Discussion ensued on community. Chairperson Plaag talked about the second paragraph on packet page 34 and stated that what is written there is not true. He stated that there is no association between the Junaluska neighborhood or community or colored people at any time prior to 1963.

JHA Member Jackson asked Chairperson Plaag to send the proposed changes discussed in this meeting to JHA Member Keefe for her review. Chairperson Plaag said he would send the proposed changes to her.

Discussion ensued on discernable evidence of headstones on the west side of African Street where the graveyard would have been located. Chairperson Plaag said he could add in a footnote about what happened at this location. He said there may have been a graveyard at the old Mennonite Brethren Church but there is no indication of headstones in the image before the church was there. Chairperson Plaag stated his response for the 1918 construction date of said church and he noted that the Richert book is not a primary source for this date. He said he would find a way to address Ms. Keefe's comment "there is no controversy about the date the church was built". Ms. Keefe further stated in her comments that the JHA has a

photograph dated around 1918 of the newly built church and she referenced page 54 of “Go Tell It on the Mountain” book or you may contact the Mennonite Brethren Church for primary source evidence. JHA Member, Ms. Roberta Jackson said she will ask a lady that she met at her church in September 2019, whom is the historian for the Boone Mennonite Brethren Church.

Discussion ensued on the photograph of the 1918 Mennonite Church. Chairperson Plaag said he did not know where this photograph is located; but he would be glad to examine it for primary source evidence. Chairperson Plaag said that he believes that the church owned the land as of 1919.

Motion and Vote:

Vice-Chairperson Pollitt made a motion, seconded by Member Bond for the HPC members to continue the discussion on the draft Junaluska Marker Application at the next HPC meeting.

Vote:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Historic Design Guidelines

Chairperson Plaag suggested tabling this agenda topic to the next meeting. The HPC members were in agreement to table this agenda topic.

Motion and Vote:

Member Brantz made a motion, seconded by Vice-Chairperson Pollitt to table the Historic Design Guidelines agenda item to the next HPC meeting.

Vote:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Other Matters by Commission Members or Staff

Chairperson Plaag suggested adding the following agenda items to the next HPC meeting agenda: Survey Presentation to Council, Junaluska Marker Application and Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

Adjournment

With no other topics to discuss, Chairperson Plaag adjourned the meeting at 5 p.m.

Eric Plaag, Chairperson

Marlene Crosby, Board Secretary

**TOWN OF BOONE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
NOVEMBER 12, 2019
3:00 PM**

Historic Preservation Commission Members in Attendance: Chairperson Eric Plaag, Vice-Chairperson Phoebe Pollitt, Bettie Bond, Teresa Pearman, Chuck Watkins and Rennie Brantz

Town Staff in Attendance: Jane Shook-Director of Planning & Inspections and Marlene Crosby-Board Secretary

Others Present:

Call to Order

Chairperson Eric Plaag called the meeting of the Boone Historic Preservation Commission, held in the Planning & Inspections upstairs conference room located at 680 West King Street, to order at 3:02 p.m.

Adoption of Agenda

Chairperson Plaag noted that he would like to amend the agenda to insert an Appalachian Theatre topic between agenda item three and four.

Member Brantz made a motion, seconded by Vice-Chairperson Pollitt to adopt the agenda as amended.

Vote:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Approval of Minutes

Discussion ensued on asking Ms. Marlene Crosby, Board Secretary to revisit the Junaluska Marker Application agenda item in the October 15, 2019 meeting minutes. Chairperson Plaag noted that there was some discussion that needed to be added into the minutes for said agenda item and there were some grammatical errors to be changed in the Downtown Survey Boundary Map agenda item.

Motion and Vote:

Member Bond made a motion, seconded by Member Brantz to table the approval of the October 15, 2019 meeting minutes to the next HPC meeting to allow Ms. Crosby time to expand on the Junaluska Marker Application minutes.

Communication: November 12, 2019 Meeting Minutes (Approval of Minutes)

Vote:

Aye-All

Nay-None

The motion passed.

Appalachian Theatre

Chairperson Plaag explained that this agenda item was added for informational purposes only. He handed out a five-page slide presentation that was presented at the Council meeting by Mr. Paul Forte, Appalachian State University-Vice Chancellor (permanently on file). Chairperson Plaag explained that the Council has approved to send this topic to the public hearing on Monday, November 25, 2019 at 6 p.m. to hear a text amendment to allow University uses at the theater. Chairperson Plaag explained that the Town of Boone has initiated the proposed text amendment.

Hayes Bryan Cemetery

Chairperson Plaag explained that Ms. Jane Shook, Director of Planning and Inspections was presenting an update on the Hayes Bryan Cemetery for Ms. Christy Turner, Senior Planner who was unable to attend this meeting. Ms. Shook noted that Ms. Turner was unable to find the property owner for the property and a title search will need to be completed to determine ownership. Ms. Shook noted that currently two elderly gentlemen mow the cemetery grounds.

Downtown Survey Boundary Map

Chairperson Plaag informed the HPC that the Council approved the draft Survey Boundary map as a working boundary. Ms. Shook said the Council approved Chairperson Plaag to send the Survey Boundary Report to the State Historic Preservation Office for approval. And once the State approves it, the HPC can begin working on the Historic district based on the initial boundaries. Chairperson Plaag said that he hopes to wrap up the District Designation Report in December of 2019 and have the final draft ready by early in January 2020. He noted more HPC meetings may be needed to complete this draft. Ms. Shook said if the Council feels it is needed, there may be another joint meeting with the Council, HPC and CAC to discuss the Survey Boundary. Ms. Shook said that she will know more about additional meetings after the December 2019 Council meetings.

Ms. Shook explained that the Historic Preservation Commission and the Community Appearance Commission are working on the draft guidelines for the Downtown area and the goal is to complete the draft guidelines at the same time. She noted that the Council's number one goal is to protect the Downtown area.

Junaluska Marker Application

Chairperson Plaag talked about tabling this agenda item until the January 14, 2019 HPC meeting. He said that he hoped that at least one representative of the Junaluska Heritage Association is able to attend this HPC meeting.

Member Bond made a motion, seconded by Member Pearman to table the Junaluska Marker Application agenda item and add it to the January 14, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission meeting agenda and invite at least one member of the Junaluska Heritage Association to attend this HPC meeting.

Vote:

Aye-All

Nay-None

The motion passed.

Historic Design Guidelines

He noted that included in the meeting packet is a copy of the Rules of Procedure of the Town of Boone Historic Preservation Commission, effective January 12, 2016. He asked that the HPC members bring this information with them to each subsequent HPC meeting regarding the current Design Guidelines. He also asked that each HPC member review the information prior to each meeting. He noted that at each meeting the Staff will provide them with an updated draft copy prior to each meeting with the date of the meeting in the header. He said he would make a brand-new draft document that reflects the current work of the Commission and he will send it to the Staff. He noted that many changes to the Design Guidelines have been made and to see the meeting minutes for details. He said the Staff will go over the Design Guidelines review process as soon as possible and get it back to Chairperson Plaag, so he can modify the Design Guidelines.

Chairperson Plaag begin discussion on the Historic Design Guidelines. On page two of the guidelines, Chairperson Plaag said he would update the names on that page, on page five, he said he would review the Purpose and Applicability of the Guidelines to make it specifies Downtown Boone, on page seven he said the Town Attorney should review the Legal Overview to make sure any updates are needed, on page nine he said only the Municipal Service District is eligible for the Façade Incentive Grant Program, he said he would modify the text to make that more clear, on page 12 and 13 he said he would like to remove some of this information and add some reduced down information from the survey report that talks about the evolution of Downtown Boone architecture, on page 15 he said he would revise this section as needed, on pages 16 through 22 he said, "The Architectural Character of Boone" section needs to be removed because some of the information does not apply to Downtown Boone, he said instead would like to add the information some of the Downtown buildings and why they are significant in Downtown Boone, on page 22 he would like to remove the "Potential Historic Districts in Boone" because this section does not talk about Downtown Boone and on page 23 through 31 he said he would like remove many of the out of date photos and replace them with more relevant photos of Downtown Boone.

Discussion ensued on the Organization of the Town of Boone Historic Preservation Commission. Chairperson Plaag said he would review and update this section. Ms. Shook said that there will

be a future change to the Historic Preservation Commission. The change will be for the HPC to have five seats and two Council liaisons.

Chairperson Plaag continued with the following proposed changes: on page 33, he said he would review the Design Review Process for modifications.

Discussion ensued on Evaluation Criteria for Proposed Construction. Ms. Shook said she would send Chairperson Plaag the definitions for the primary and secondary facades to include in the draft text. Member Bond noted that she thought the third area or Tertiary AVC is important. Ms. Shook explained the secondary façade definition and said from the appearance standards the facades do not regulate the same way. Chairperson Plaag noted that he would like to reserve the third category because of other possible recommendations.

Chairperson Plaag said on page 34 on “Types of Exterior Projects”, he noted that he has seen changes to major work but he does not see changes to minor work. He reviewed the three categories for this section. He explained what triggers a Certificate of Appropriateness. He said he and Ms. Shook would review the process and he would revise this section accordingly. He did suggest having further discussion on the re-pointing of brick. Member Watkins asked about the change of building materials on flat or low sloped roofs not visible from the street. Chairperson Plaag said that he would add to the proposed text to include changes to sloping on roofs is considered major work.

Discussion ensued on Completing the COA Application. Chairperson Plaag asked the Planning Staff to review the application in terms of process.

Chairperson Plaag reviewed page 41 of the guidelines and said that a flow chart recording the COA process is needed and asked if the Planning Staff could create it.

Chairperson Plaag explained that on page 43 that originally the Historic Design Guidelines were divided into three categories, he said that two of the categories were for Residential and Commercial Properties. He suggested, he could change the title to “Design Guidelines for Residential Properties within the Downtown Boone Historic District because these standards would still apply to them. He said he would also clarify that for the purpose of this section a residential property is defined as a property originally built for residential purposes even if it currently used for commercial purposes. He also referred to the Jones House as an example for this section. He further explained that this section of the Historic Design Guidelines has not been reviewed before by the HPC. He suggested revising the photos and the HPC would review the proposed text at future meetings.

Discussion ensued on the Design Guidelines for Commercial Properties. Chairperson Plaag noted that the HPC has reviewed this section up to Section 10.0 Utilities and Energy Retrofit.

Discussion ensued on the Historic Design Guidelines. Chairperson Plaag confirmed that the Historic Design Guidelines have not been adopted and have always been in draft form.

Chairperson Plaag suggested starting with a new document that reflects the previous and current proposed changes to the draft document. The HPC members were in consensus to move forward in the way that Chairperson Plaag has suggested at this meeting.

Discussion ensued on paint. Chairperson Plaag informed the HPC that he had spoken to Ms. Annie McDonald from the SHPO and she told him the best way to have good will is to not regulate paint color and be vague about the standards for it. He said having the review requirement and not a specific set of standards allows you to not make the applicant feel like they are being micromanaged. She said you can still have the requirement for the COA process where it is subject to review.

It was the consensus of the HPC members to loosen the requirements on color. Chairperson Plaag said he would make the proposed changes on the paint.

Chairperson Plaag said he would revise the proposed draft document and bring it to the next HPC meeting for review and discussion.

Chairperson Plaag talked about the third section in this draft document called “Design Guidelines for Historic Streetscapes, Landscapes, Cemeteries, Monuments, and Other Resources” on page 96 he suggested to remove cemeteries from this title because there are no cemeteries in the Downtown area. He said he would keep the text on architectural language.

Other Matters by Commission Members or Staff

Discussion ensued on the scheduling of additional HPC meetings to work on the Historic Design Guidelines. Chairperson Plaag suggested scheduling a special HPC meeting on Tuesday, December 17, 2019 at 3 p.m. and on January 7, 2020 at 3 p.m. He also noted that the next regular HPC meeting will be on Tuesday, December 10, 2019 at 3 p.m. and all of these meetings are to be held in the Planning and Inspections Department – Upstairs Conference Room located at 680 W. King Street.

Ms. Shook reminded the HPC members about the Volunteer Breakfast that will be held on Friday, December 13, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. at the Dan’l Boone Inn Restaurant.

Chairperson Plaag talked about the 2020 projects that the HPC need to work on such as: Design Guidelines for the Linney House the Post Office, Burrell Marker Application and the cemetery which is a marker request.

Chairperson Plaag said the Horn in the West, Dan’l Boone Gardens and the Edmisten Farm properties need to be re-surveyed. He said the cemetery survey will be finished in the spring.

Discussion ensued on internships. Member Brantz said he had received a letter regarding internships. He asked Chairperson Plaag for his opinion on internships. Chairperson Plaag explained the process of the work that is needed at Digital Watauga. He talked about his experience working with both graduate students and under-graduate students as interns. He

said that preferred to have graduate students working at Digital Watauga. He noted that some of the interns have done really poor work on the jobs assigned to them.

Chairperson Plaag suggested adding the following agenda item to the next HPC meeting agenda: Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

Adjournment

With no other topics to discuss, Member Brantz made a motion, seconded by Member Bond to adjourn the meeting at 4:48 p.m.

Eric Plaag, Chairperson

Marlene Crosby, Board Secretary