



COMMUNITY APPEARANCE COMMISSION MEETING AGENDA

A meeting of the Town of Boone Community Appearance Commission will be held on **Tuesday, January 23, 2018 at 5:30 p.m.** in the Planning and Inspections Department - Upstairs Conference Room located at 680 W. King Street. The following items will be on the agenda:

- 1. Adoption of Agenda**
- 2. Approval of Minutes**
 - September 26, 2017 Meeting
 - December 12, 2017 CAC/HPC/TC Workshop
- 3. Election of Officers**
- 4. Discussion of the Downtown Design Guidelines Workshop**
- 5. Other Matters by Board Members or Staff**
- 6. Adjournment**

**TOWN OF BOONE
COMMUNITY APPEARANCE COMMISSION
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 26, 2017
5:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS
PRESENT:**

Chairperson Brian Williams, Vice-Chairperson Jason Selong
Daniel Johnson, Sarah Davis Cagle, Charlotte Mizelle and
Jeannine Underdown Collins

STAFF PRESENT:

Jane Shook-Director of Planning and Inspections, Brian
Johnson, Urban Design Specialist and Marlene Crosby-
Board Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Williams called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Chairperson Williams welcomed new Member Daniel Johnson to the Commission.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Chairperson Williams made a motion, seconded by Member Cagle to accept the agenda as written.

VOTE:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairperson Williams made a motion, seconded by Member Cagle to approve the August 22, 2017 meeting minutes as written.

VOTE:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

DOWNTOWN DESIGN GUIDELINES UPDATE

Ms. Jane Shook, Director of Planning and Inspections explained that Council has approved the Community Appearance Commission to get public input on the draft Downtown Design Guidelines. She said the draft regulations need to be completed and presented to Council.

Ms. Shook explained that the Town has been working on a contract with the School of Government for Howard Street. She said a market analysis will be done to help the Town locate potential areas for development. She said for the contract the recommendations for the Downtown Design

Guidelines are needed from the Community Appearance Commission and the Historic Preservation Commission for Howard Street.

Ms. Shook said an action request has been sent to Council for their September 2017 meeting. She said the action request was regarding direction from Council for the CAC and HPC regarding the regulations for the Downtown Appearance Standards. She said once the Council direction is given to the two Commissions, a more predictable outcome can be given to the School of Government. She added that she did include a brief summary of each committees work with the action request.

Ms. Shook told the CAC members that the HPC members voted for Chairman Eric Plaag to attend the September 2017 Council meeting to answer questions. Ms. Shook said that other HPC members may attend the Council meeting as well.

Ms. Shook told the CAC members that the HPC survey will be completed the end of September 2017 and the HPC will need to evaluate it at their October 2017 meeting.

Ms. Shook said there might need to be another meeting with the CAC and HPC to work on some of the areas on Howard Street.

Member Mizelle asked about the additional buildings that were added in the blue section of the map (see permanently attached). Ms. Shook confirmed at the last CAC meeting there was a consensus for Staff to add the Footsloggers and ECRS buildings to the Downtown Historic Core section of the map.

Vice-Chairperson Selong asked about the proposed regulations. Ms. Shook said the Secretary of the Interior Standards have been adopted by the Town and the proposed regulations change would involve a zoning and map amendment change.

Ms. Shook invited the CAC members to attend the September 2017 Council meeting to hear the Council's discussion on the action request. She noted that this Council agenda item will be covered later in their meeting.

Member Collins talked about the look of Howard Street with the transition from Rivers Street. She said her concern is if a more historic look is added to Howard Street, the feel for a more artsy-type look may be lost.

Member Collins asked how many property owners on Howard Street have been notified of the proposed regulations.

Ms. Shook said the property owners were notified by the Downtown Boone Development Association through the HPC survey for the Municipal Service District. Ms. Shook said that a public meeting was held at the Watauga County library over one year ago.

Ms. Shook said before a property owner can make changes to the exterior of their property, they would have to obtain a "Certificate of Appropriateness" from the Historic Preservation Commission.

She said this is a permitting process in addition to a zoning permit process. She said the property owner would have to satisfy the HPC's requirements before the zoning permit process.

Discussion ensued on the design of a building. Chairperson Williams said he felt that there will be more restrictions on the expansion of buildings by the Town following the Secretary of Interiors Standards.

Member Mizelle said that she agrees with Member Collins regarding her desire to see a more festive look for a transition over to Rivers Street as well as preserve what is truly historic.

Member Mizelle asked if the HPC guidelines controlled the inside of a historic building. Ms. Shook said for Landmarks, there are certain times that the guidelines control the inside of a building. She noted this is a different process in a historic district.

Vice-Chairperson Selong talked about looking at each building on a case by case basis.

Vice-Chairperson Selong made a motion, seconded by Member Cagle for Chairperson Williams to attend the September 28, 2017 Council meeting to get direction from Council for the Community Appearance Commission regarding the Downtown Design Guidelines.

VOTE:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

OTHER MATTERS BY BOARD MEMBERS OR STAFF

There were no others topics discussed at this meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Williams made a motion, seconded by Member Collins to adjourn the meeting at 6:01 p.m.

VOTE:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Chairperson, Brian Williams

Marlene Crosby, Board Secretary

**TOWN OF BOONE
COMMUNITY APPEARANCE COMMISSION
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 12, 2017
5:30 P.M.**

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT: Rennie Brantz, Loretta Clawson, Jeannine Underdown Collins and Charlotte Mizelle

COMMUNITY APPEARANCE COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairperson Brian Williams, Vice-Chairperson Jason Selong Sarah Davis Cagle, Charlotte Mizelle and Jeannine Underdown Collins

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairperson Eric Plaag, Bettie Bond, Chuck Watkins, Bill Dixon, Loretta Clawson and Rennie Brantz

STAFF PRESENT: Jane Shook-Director of Planning and Inspections, Brian Johnson-Urban Design Specialist, Christy Turner-Senior Planner, Marty Little-Planner and Marlene Crosby-Board Secretary

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Ward-Town Manager and Brittney Clark-Downtown Development Coordinator

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Rennie Brantz called the workshop for the Boone Town Council, Community Appearance Commission and the Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:35 p.m. in the Council Chambers located at 1500 Blowing Rock Road. Mayor Brantz welcomed everyone to the workshop.

Ms. Jane Shook, Director of Planning and Inspections Department explained that the purpose of this workshop is to focus on the Downtown area. She said the Community Appearance Commission and the Historic Preservation Commission have been working on different projects that are inter-related. She said the goal of the workshop is to come to a consensus of the boundaries for the CAC who is working on the Downtown Design Guidelines. She said the CAC has proposed a historic core interface area for the Downtown area. She said the HPC has been working on establishing a historic district for the Downtown area.

The Staff handed out at this workshop the following items for the Downtown Design Guidelines: The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Map of the Parcel Boundaries, Municipal Service District, Downtown Historic Core and Downtown Interface Area, Draft copy of UDO Article 25: Community Appearance Standards and a document prepared in December 2017 by Chairperson Plaag entitled Dates of Construction, Buildings in Downtown Boone Municipal Service District and a copy of the High Country Magazine dated December 2017 (permanently attached).

DISCUSSION OF THE DOWNTOWN DESIGN GUIDELINES

Historic Preservation Commission Chairperson Plaag gave a presentation on the early development of the Downtown area which included photos of the area.

Chairperson Plaag talked about the images of Downtown Boone buildings that were captured in the High Country Magazine article entitled Digital Watauga. He referred to page 62 of the article in the magazine and talked about all of the buildings located in that photo.

Chairperson Plaag said the HPC was tasked with surveying the buildings in the Downtown area that were of 50 years of age or approaching 50 years of age. He said he asked the survey techs to start surveying the buildings that were 35 years of age in the Municipal Service District. He explained that the HPC removed the buildings that did not fit into this timeframe. He said they removed the old Deal, Moseley and Smith Law Office Building, the Chalet-style law office building located near Mr. Browns Law Office, an old apartment complex that looked like an old hotel behind the old jail house.

Chairperson Plaag noted that the items in blue are the ones located on Hippy Hill that is located across the street from the Turchin Center and the First Baptist Church.

Chairperson Plaag said the photo on page 62 of the High Country Magazine depicts the remnants of architecture from the turn of the century.

Chairperson Plaag noted that when the railroad came through Boone the Town had the ability to build larger brick structures in the Downtown area. He said before the railroad they did not have the means to carry heavy materials up the mountain into the Town. He said commercial brick commercial buildings were starting to be built in the Downtown area around 1920.

Chairperson Plaag talked about the row of brick buildings along King Street looking like they were all one continuous building but they were all separate businesses.

Chairperson Plaag pointed out some of the things on the buildings that were the beginning of the issues with the various architectural looks in the Downtown buildings. He said there were framed buildings and brick buildings. He said some of the building owners tried to change the look of their buildings to make it a better fit or more functional or to compete with other buildings in the Downtown area by adding porches.

It was noted that the reason there were so many hotels in the Town of Boone in the earlier days was because the Town of Boone was the County seat.

Chairperson Plaag talked about the Past Time Theatre closing in 1959 and the owner changing the façade by adding concrete panels to the old Past Time Theatre to close off the windows and added windows on the second level of the building.

Chairperson Plaag said the HPC has talked for a long time about not wanting cultured stone on the buildings in the Downtown area. He pointed out that cultured stone is now a historic treatment because it is now 50 years old. He said there are five buildings in Downtown Boone that were built between 1959 and 1963 that were either built with cultured stone or had cultured stone applied to them. He explained that the way around this topic is to put in the context statement that will be written for this district and the things that describe what are contributing to the development to Boone and are representative of the development of Boone. He said the survey team may say that the cut-off is going to be 1960 because the development in Boone was happening largely between 1920 and 1960 here are the buildings that are representative of those changes. He further explained that it will depend on the Council and HPC accepting this recommendation.

Council Member Collins asked about the use of Crab Orchard stone versus cultured stone. HPC Chairperson Plaag said he would need to do some research on the Crab Orchard stone.

Chairperson Plaag said this presentation explains how the development of the Town of Boone got to where it is over time.

Discussion ensued on the booming of development before and after World War II. Chairperson Plaag said some of the development in Boone occurred during this timeframe. He said the railroad and train service enabled a lot of the development because the building materials could be brought into Town more easily.

CAC Chairperson Williams asked about the applications to historic buildings prior to 1960. HPC Chairperson Plaag said an argument could be made that these type structures are contributing because they reflect another booming of development in the early 1960's which included the use of cultured stone.

Discussion ensued on cultured stone. Mr. Brian Johnson, Urban Design Specialist asked HPC Chairperson Plaag to define cultured stone. HPC Chairperson Plaag said it is called native stone. Chairperson Plaag said he thinks of cultured stone like a cultured pearl. HPC Chairperson Plaag defined cultured stone as being made with concrete mold and being painted or having something applied to it to make it look like a rock, when it is not a real rock.

Mr. Johnson asked HPC Chairperson Plaag which previous buildings were considered to have cultural stone on them. HPC Chairperson Plaag said the Mysterium building (Old Watauga Insurance building) had an application of cultural stone. HPC Chairperson Plaag noted that when the Linney Law office was added to the old Eggers, Eggers, Eggers and Eggers law office cultured stone was used to make the two offices look the same.

Mr. Johnson asked if cultured stone was common at that time. HPC Chairperson Plaag said that he would have research this to be sure but it is his feeling that cultural stone was applied. HPC Chairperson Plaag said that cultured stone was applied on buildings to make them appear architecturally as an older building, when the building is not older than it looks.

Ms. Shook explained that the CAC is at the point of needing public input on their proposed Downtown Design guidelines and the HPC is close to needing public input on a district. Ms. Shook added that the Town has been working on a contract with the UNC School of Government Development Finance Initiative on Howard Street. Ms. Shook said the Town needs direction so they can move forward with their contract. Ms. Shook noted that the Staff wants to limit confusion with the terms historic core and historic interface as much as possible, when dealing with the public.

Ms. Shook noted that there has been little change to the draft design guidelines since the last CAC meeting except for the addition of some HPC recommendations and revisions to the Downtown Historic Core and Interface Area map that were directed by Council and these revisions are included in the handouts for this workshop.

Discussion ensued on the addition of some other properties into the Historic Core. Ms. Shook noted that HPC Chairperson Plaag recommended adding the Footsloggers building, rock climbing area, ECRS Software building and Espresso News Coffee shop building because the Survey team would recommend it. He noted all of these buildings were at one time tied together with the Winkler Motors Complex.

Mr. Ward talked about the Town daylighting the stream next to the Goodnight Brothers property. He said one of the issues of re-developing this area is the need to push the development up towards Howard Street to be able to use the square area (shown on the map) for development on this property and to open up the stream. He said there are other issues with redevelopment of a one-story structure on this property because of the price per acre and the square footage of it. It was noted that this area is in the floodway.

Mr. Ward said that Appalachian State University is a willing participant in returning the surface parking lot back to the tax rolls of the Town.

HPC Chairperson Plaag talked about the Goodnight Brothers property that touches the apartment building was not built until 1958 and it has been ravaged overtime and he does not see it a contributing structure.

HPC Chairperson Plaag talked about the access to the Goodnight Brothers property and the possibility of having a parking deck there which could reduce the traffic looking for parking off of King Street and onto Howard Street. Mr. Ward pointed out that there are three potential locations for a parking deck in Downtown Boone.

Mr. Ward said he has talked with the new owner of the PNC Bank and they want to do a façade restoration for this building. He said we need to try to get the regulations in place before more new development or redevelopment is proposed in the Downtown area.

HPC Chairperson Plaag talked about the boundaries of the district. He talked about proposing a separate district for Hippie Hill called Chappell Wilson District because these buildings are not contributing structures because of their prior modifications.

Discussion ensued on having different districts in the Downtown Area. Mr. Ward said that the districts can be spread out over Town as long as there is a defined area.

HPC Chairperson Plaag said he would like to see King Street, Water Street, Depot Street and Howard Street included in the Historic Core. He further explained that the properties on the south side of Howard Street have been altered and do not fit the timeframe of prior to 1960. He said he could support these properties going away with the exception of the properties on the southwest corner of Depot Street and Howard Street which were constructed in the 1940's.

HPC Chairperson Plaag said from a preservation standpoint, you want to try to keep things that are representative of your theme or history in your district. Some of the structures that do this are the tin building and Wilson Feed Store which were typical warehouse block buildings. It was noted that the condition of a structure can be factored in.

Mr. Ward explained that a developer is potentially interested in putting a restaurant in the block building near the corner of Depot Street and Howard Street.

HPC Chairperson Plaag explained what is trying to be accomplished with the Downtown Design Guidelines. He explained that the guidelines are what will tell a developer what is allowed in the Downtown area.

Discussion ensued on potential issues with the parcel boundaries. It was noted that the CAC does not have the authority to become involved with these types of potential issues. Ms. Shook said the CAC is not saying that something cannot be torn down. She said it would be the owner's choice and the regulations would guide it. Ms. Shook said that there might need to be additional regulation on scale and form in relationship to the street to help distinguish the interface area from the Downtown core.

Ms. Shook added that the CAC and the HPC are interested in preserving historic structures.

Discussion ensued on the structures on the south side of Howard Street. Mr. Ward talked about moving the driveway for the building on the corner of S. Depot Street and removing the driveway access from Howard Street for the re-development of the structure beside Mr. Gilbert's office.

HPC Chairperson Plaag said there could conceivably be a "warehouse district" that could include the structures on the north side of Howard Street which could fit this type of district.

HPC Chairperson Plaag said there is a potential for three districts. He said this area would include the businesses along King Street for the Downtown core. Another district could be an interface district that would be called the "warehouse district" which would include the old dealership businesses and all along the north side of Howard Street because they are mostly concrete structures. Mr. Ward said the proposed idea of a Warehouse district would help protect the Downtown core.

Mr. Ward said his concern with the public input process is not having enough support of the elected officials for a final decision because so much was included. He said he is also concerned with the funding with the quasi-judicial process.

Mr. Ward explained that the alley beside the PNC bank building is owned by the Town. This alley is where the mail was brought to the post office from the railroad. He said the new building owner is in support of keeping this alley way open to allow for pedestrian traffic. It was noted that this alley way extends past Howard Street.

Discussion ensued on extending the Downtown core. Mr. Ward pointed out, if the County buildings were included in the Downtown core, the County would have to get permits through the Town. It was noted that the Old Jailhouse building would not be included in the Downtown Core because the property owner has agreed for this building to be designated as a local landmark. It was noted that the approved Marketplace development is on two parcels. HPC Chairperson Plaag said the parcel fronting Water Street and King Street would have to go through the COA process but the current Cilantro's Restaurant building would not have to go through the COA process. He said it would fall into the Warehouse district and would have more flexibility than in the Downtown core.

Mr. Ward explained that a developer may be proposing a hotel with a parking garage on the corner King Street and Water Street. It was noted that the hotel could be in the Downtown core and the garage in the Interface area on Howard Street.

Discussion ensued on the approved Marketplace Development. Ms. Shook explained what was approved on this case and how long the approvals are in place.

Ms. Shook said she felt there was consensus from the Council, CAC and HPC for Staff to revise the map per the discussion at this workshop. She asked the individual Commissions, if they would approve the individual Chairpersons to work with Staff on the revision to the map and then the Chairpersons bring back the revisions to each Commission for their review and discussion. Ms. Shook said by doing this work at the same time maybe both Commissions could have their public hearings together.

Motion and Vote:

HPC Member Dixon made a motion, seconded by Member Bond to allow the HPC Chairperson Plaag to work with Staff on redrawing the boundary lines on the map as discussed in this workshop.

VOTE:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

Motion and Vote:

Council Member Collins made a motion, seconded by CAC Member Sarah Davis Cagle to allow the CAC Chairperson Williams to work with Staff on redrawing the boundary lines on the map as discussed in this workshop.

VOTE:

Aye – All

Nay – None

The motion passed.

It was the consensus of the Council, HPC and CAC for Staff to also work on the scale and form of the buildings while they are redrawing the boundary lines.

It was noted that the CAC members will need to work on regulations for the proposed “warehouse district”.

Council Member Collins asked about the use of Crab Orchard Stone on facades of buildings. She said that she did not want this material pulled off of the buildings, if it is an allowed building material. HPC Chairperson Plaag said he would research this type of stone. It was noted that the Crab Orchard Stone is a real stone and there is a veneer of it as well.

BOONE 2030 AND COMPREHENSIVE PLAN MERGER

Ms. Shook explained that Mr. Phil Trew from the High Country Council of Governments has been working with the Town on merging the 2006 Comprehensive Plan and the 2030 Masterplan. She said the first rough draft has been completed and she handed out copies at this workshop for everyone to review (permanently attached). She noted that because preservation and appearance are closely related, she would like for everyone to read through the entire draft document which is 58 pages long. She said that the Planning Commission would also be reviewing the draft document as well. She said she would like to begin discussions on the draft document at the next scheduled meetings in January 2018. She said the draft document is online at www.townofboone.net and Staff can supply hard copies, if needed. It was noted that the name of the adopted document would be based on the date of the document which is an industry rule. It was noted that there will be language included in the adopted document that the previous 2006 Comprehensive Plan and 2030 Masterplan are no longer in affect. She said the new rough draft does reference the other adopted plans of the Town. She pointed out that there is an Urban Forestry Master Plan and a recently adopted Bicycle Pedestrian Plan that can be found on the Town website under the Planning & Inspections Department.

HPC Chairperson Plaag thanked the Council, Mr. Ward and the Staff for allowing this workshop because he felt the discussions were incredibly productive. He thanked the CAC for their efforts on the design guidelines. He said he felt that he and CAC Chairperson Williams could work together on the details of the proposed design guidelines. Mr. Ward thanked everyone for their work on the proposed design guidelines.

ADJOURNMENT

Mayor Brantz adjourned the workshop at 7:35 p.m.

Mayor, Rennie Brantz

CAC Chairperson, Brian Williams

HPC Chairperson, Eric Plaag

Board Secretary, Marlene Crosby